IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

v. CRIMINAL NO. 05-4 ERIE

EUGENE LAMONT GAVIN

SENTENCING

Proceedings held before the HONORABLE

SEAN J. McLAUGHLIN, U.S. District Judge,

in Courtroom C, U.S. Courthouse, Erie,

Pennsylvania, on Wednesday, January 11, 2006.

APPEARANCES:

MARSHALL J. PICCININI, Assistant United States Attorney, appearing on behalf of the Government.

DANIEL J. BRABENDER, JR., Esquire, appearing on

Case 1:05-cr-00004-SJM Document 70 Filed 02/28/2006 Page 2 of 65 behalf of the Defendant.

Ronald J. Bench, RMR - Official Court Reporter

1	INDEX					
2						
3	WITNESSES:	DII	RECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS
4	FOR THE GOVERNMEN	Γ:				
5	Michelle Welsh	3	18	26,32		
6						
7						
8						
9						
10	EXHIBITS:		IDEN	TIFIED	ADMITTI	ED
11	FOR THE GOVERNMEN	T:				
12	Government Exhibit 1			28	36	
13	Government Exhibit 2			33	36	

Case 1:05-cr-00004-SJM Document 70 Filed 02/28/2006 Page 4 of 65

- 8 are some exceptions to the presentence report. Pertinently, an
- 9 objection to the conclusion by the probation officer as to the
- 10 amount of drugs involved. Mr. Piccinini, is there going to be
- 11 some proof put on in that regard?
- MR. PICCININI: Yes, there is, your Honor. At this
- 13 time I would call Michelle Welsh to testify.
- 14 (Recess from 9:57 a.m.; until 10:00 a.m.)
- 15 THE COURT: All right, Mr. Piccinini.
- MR. PICCININI: Your Honor, at this time I would
- 17 call Michelle Welsh to testify. Michelle, please come forward.
- THE COURT: Come on up here, my deputy clerk will
- 19 swear you in.
- THE CLERK: Raise your right hand.
- 21 MICHELLE WELSH, GOVERNMENT WITNESS, SWORN
- 22 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 23 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 24 Q. Please state your full name for the record?
- 25 A. Michelle Welsh.

4

l Q. Ms. Welsh, are you currently employed?

- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Where do you work?
- 4 A. Country Fair.
- 5 Q. And are you the Michelle Welsh who actually is charged in
- 6 the same case with Mr. Gavin in an indictment alleging the two
- 7 of you are involved in a conspiracy to possess with intent to
- 8 distribute and distribute crack cocaine?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And you were charged in this case in January of 2005, is
- 11 that correct?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And after you were charged in January of 2005, you sought
- 14 the appointment of counsel and the Federal Public Defender's
- 15 Office here in Erie was appointed to represent you, is that
- 16 correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. You came to court here today with Assistant Federal
- 19 Public Defender Tom Patton, who's been representing you in your
- 20 criminal charges, is that correct?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Now, with regard to your current status with regard to
- 23 this indictment, back on August 19, 2005, did you also enter a

- 24 plea of guilty to your role in the conspiracy, just as Mr.
- 25 Gavin has?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Now, you're here testifying today and you've previously
- 3 talked to law enforcement and confessed to your role in this
- 4 particular offense, is that correct?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. In confessing to the police and in testifying here today,
- 7 is it your hope -- since the time that you were talking with
- 8 the police throughout the last year and a half, that if you
- 9 were to cooperate with law enforcement, that you would receive
- 10 some sentencing benefit?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And when you initially confessed to the law enforcement
- 13 officers, members of the EAGLE Task Force, did they tell you
- 14 that if you came clean and confessed to your role in this
- 15 crime, that the information would be provided to my office and
- 16 that you might receive a break somewhere down the line?
- 17 A. Yes.

- 18 Q. Has anyone guaranteed what the judge may do if we request
- 19 him to reduce your sentence?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. And with regard to your testimony here today, were you
- 22 arrested just like Mr. Welsh was and approached by law
- 23 enforcement with regard to this indictment?
- 24 A. Do you mean Mr. Gavin?
- 25 Q. Mr. Gavin, excuse me.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. At the time you talked to law enforcement, were you first
- 3 interviewed by them concerning this particular conspiracy on
- 4 August 27, 2004?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And at that time did you make statements to them, in
- 7 August of 2004, about your conspiracy, you're being involved in
- 8 a conspiracy with Mr. Gavin?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Did you admit to them that you actually were purchasing
- 11 crack cocaine from Mr. Gavin and you actually was selling that

- 12 crack cocaine out on the streets in Erie?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Were you up front with them back in August of 2004?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Now, I'm going to ask you to explain to Judge McLaughlin
- 17 how it was that you became involved with Mr. Gavin?
- 18 A. My boyfriend, Anthony Gambill.
- 19 Q. And your boyfriend, Anthony Gambill, in April of 2004,
- 20 was he placed under arrest and sent to the Erie County Prison?
- 21 A. Yes, April 2nd.
- 22 THE COURT: You're going to have to keep your voice
- 23 up and talk slowly, please. Start that over again.
- 24 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 25 Q. Your boyfriend, Anthony Gambill, in April of 2004, was he

- 1 placed under arrest and sent to the Erie County Prison?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And was it likely that he was going to remain in the Erie
- 4 County Prison or in prison for some period of time?
- 5 A. Yes.

- 6 Q. Prior to April of 2004, was your boyfriend, Anthony
- 7 Gambill, involved in the sales of crack cocaine?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And did he have various clients prior to being arrested
- 10 that he was able to get -- to buy crack cocaine from?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Were you living with Anthony Gambill before he went to
- 13 prison?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Were you pregnant at the time or did you have a child by
- 16 Anthony Gambill?
- 17 A. Yes, after he was incarcerated.
- 18 Q. After Anthony Gambill went to jail, did you and he talk
- 19 about you taking over his crack cocaine sales so that you could
- 20 make some money to afford to live by?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. In your conversations with Anthony Gambill, this is while
- 23 he's in prison, is that correct -- you talked to him while he
- 24 was in jail?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. What was the discussion about how and who you could buy
- 2 crack cocaine from?
- 3 A. I was supposed to purchase it from Eugene Gavin.
- 4 Q. All right. And did Anthony Gambill attempt to take some
- 5 steps to smooth things out for you so that Mr. Gavin would
- 6 trust you enough to sell you crack cocaine so you could make
- 7 some money?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Did you know whether or not Anthony Gambill and Eugene
- 10 Gavin had a long-term relationship, either as friends or
- 11 relatives or anything along those lines?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. What was the nature of their relationship?
- 14 A. They had been friends since high school, I believe.
- 15 Q. And did it appear that Eugene Gambill trusted you enough,
- 16 Eugene Gavin trusted you enough after Anthony Gambill went to
- 17 prison that he would sell you crack cocaine?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Did you take steps to call or talk to Eugene Gavin about
- 20 selling crack cocaine to you?

- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And can you indicate to Judge McLaughlin how those
- 23 conversations went and how did it come about that you bought
- 24 crack cocaine from him?
- 25 A. Anthony cleared it with Eugene --

- 1 THE COURT: Start that over again, please slow down.
- 2 Go ahead.
- THE WITNESS: Anthony cleared it with Eugene Gavin.
- 4 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 5 Q. He cleared it with Eugene Gavin?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Then what did you do, how did you reach out to him?
- 8 A. I called his cell phone.
- 9 Q. You called whose cell phone?
- 10 A. Eugene's.
- 11 Q. How did you have Eugene's cell phone number?
- 12 A. Say that again.
- 13 Q. How did you have Eugene's cell phone number?
- 14 A. Anthony gave it to me.

- 16 would the first time have been sometime in April of 2004 after
- 17 Anthony Gambill went to prison?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. In your conversation with him, did you request in some
- 20 fashion that he sell crack cocaine to you?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. What arrangements were made as to how much cocaine you
- 23 would purchase and where you would purchase it from?
- 24 A. The arrangements were that --
- 25 THE COURT: Say that again, please.

- 1 THE WITNESS: The arrangements were that he was
- 2 going to give me a deal on eight-balls.
- 3 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 4 Q. On eight-balls?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And an eight-ball is an eighth ounce of cocaine?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Are we talking powder or crack cocaine here?

- 9 A. Crack cocaine.
- 10 Q. So Eugene was going to give you a deal on eight-balls?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. How much did you understand you were going to be paying
- 13 for those eight-balls?
- 14 A. \$130.
- 15 Q. And where were you supposed to purchase the cocaine, the
- 16 crack cocaine from Eugene Gavin?
- 17 A. I met him at his house.
- 18 Q. Can you indicate to the court where his house was
- 19 located?
- 20 A. I'm not sure of the address, but it was on West 20th
- 21 Street.
- 22 Q. How did you know where the place was?
- 23 A. Anthony took me over there before.
- 24 Q. So prior to April you had been over to that residence?
- 25 A. Right.

- 1 Q. After Eugene arranged to sell you the crack cocaine, did
- 2 you go to his house and purchase an eight-ball?

- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Explain to Judge McLaughlin when you first went to his
- 5 residence -- first of all, describe the residence for the
- 6 judge, indicate whether or not you actually had been there and
- 7 how often, would you describe it for him?
- 8 A. It was -- they had a purple door downstairs, you walk up
- 9 the stairs and you walk into his living room. It's like all
- 10 opened.
- 11 Q. During the course of the time you were purchasing crack
- 12 cocaine from Mr. Gavin, did you meet members of his family
- 13 there at the house?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Who would you have met?
- 16 A. His wife, Bernadette, there was a child there.
- 17 Q. And what would you guys do there at the house on those
- 18 occasions when you purchased crack cocaine?
- 19 A. We would smoke marijuana.
- 20 Q. And who would you smoke the pot with?
- 21 A. Eugene Gavin and Bernadette Gavin.
- 22 THE COURT: And who?
- THE WITNESS: Bernadette Gavin.
- 24 THE COURT: That's his wife?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

- 1 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 2 Q. So while you're there smoking pot at the house, did you
- 3 also purchase crack cocaine?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Was there ever a time that you went to Gavin's house
- 6 after April of 2004 that you didn't purchase crack cocaine from
- 7 him?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Did you ever just go over there just to smoke pot with
- 10 them or just to socialize?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. So every time you went to his house, did you purchase
- 13 crack cocaine?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And, typically, what was the quantity of crack cocaine
- 16 that you purchased?
- 17 A. An eight-ball.
- 18 Q. And in most instances, almost every instance where you

- 19 purchased crack cocaine, was it an eight-ball?
- 20 A. Yes.
- After you went there on the first occasion with regard to 21
- purchasing crack cocaine, once you got the cocaine from Mr.
- Gavin, how long would it take you to sell the crack cocaine?
- It started out overnight. 24 A.
- 25 Q. So overnight you'd be able to sell the eight-ball that he

- 1 sold to you?
- 2 A. Yes.
- How much money were you able to make off the sale of the
- 4 crack cocaine?
- 280, 260. A.
- So \$260 to \$280? 6 Q.
- 7 A. Yes.
- And when you got the crack cocaine from Mr. Gavin, had he
- taken these steps to assist you in either breaking it down or
- discussing with you as to how those sales should occur?
- 11 A. Yes.
- Tell Judge McLaughlin what it is he did with the cocaine 12 Q.

- 13 so that you were prepared to sell it?
- 14 A. He gave it to me bagged up in little rocks.
- 15 Q. And in the eight-ball, that was a combination of a bunch
- 16 of little rocks?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. What size rocks were they?
- 19 A. Twenty pieces.
- 20 Q. Do you mean \$20 rocks?
- 21 A. Yeah, \$20 rocks.
- 22 Q. So each rock you could sell on the street for \$20?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. You said that you would be able to sell the eighth ounce
- 25 overnight?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. When you would run out of the crack cocaine that Mr.
- 3 Gavin sold to you, how long would you wait until you'd go back
- 4 to him to get more?
- 5 A. The next day.
- 6 Q. As soon as you ran out, would you go back to him?

- 7 A. The next day.
- 8 Q. So if you sold out overnight, the next day you'd go to
- 9 him to get more?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. In this particular hearing there's been a claim that Mr.
- 12 Gavin only sold crack cocaine to you on two occasions, two
- 13 eight-balls, which is about three-and-a-half grams apiece,
- 14 around seven grams. Can you indicate to Judge McLaughlin --
- 15 and you're charged in this conspiracy as well?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Whether your sales or your purchases of crack cocaine
- 18 were only limited to those two occasions?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. Over that period of time where you were purchasing from
- 21 him and you say you ran out, you'd go back to him the next day,
- 22 how frequently would you be going back to him, for what period
- 23 of time?
- 24 A. It first started out the next day and then it wasn't
- 25 right so --

- 1 THE COURT: Say that again, please?
- 2 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 3 Q. It wasn't right you said?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And what do you mean it wasn't right?
- 6 A. Like they did something to it, the people weren't liking
- 7 it.
- 8 Q. So the people who were your clients who you were selling
- 9 it to didn't like the quality of the crack cocaine?
- 10 A. Right.
- 11 Q. And did that cause it to be a couple of days for you to
- 12 get rid of the crack cocaine, instead of overnight?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And over what period of time were you going back to his
- 15 house, either every other day, excuse me, every day or every
- 16 other day, how long did that go on?
- 17 A. Till the beginning of June.
- 18 Q. Okay.
- 19 THE COURT: When did it start?
- THE WITNESS: April.
- 21 THE COURT: And in any given week between April and

- 22 June, how often did you go to his house to buy the crack
- 23 cocaine?
- 24 THE WITNESS: Every couple days.
- 25 THE COURT: So does that mean three days a week?

- 1 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- THE COURT: Go ahead.
- 3 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 4 Q. And on those three days a week would you be purchasing an
- 5 eight-ball of crack cocaine?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Did there come a point in time where Mr. Gavin -- well,
- 8 let me go back a second. In the beginning when you were
- 9 purchasing crack cocaine from him, how were you paying for the
- 10 cocaine?
- 11 A. The first two times I paid cash, and then I lost the
- 12 last.
- 13 Q. What do you mean you lost the last?
- 14 A. I lost the last package he gave me. So Anthony called
- 15 him and asked if he could front me something.

- 16 Q. Front you something?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. What does that mean to front you something?
- 19 A. To give me the drugs and after I sell them, I give him
- 20 the money.
- 21 Q. So the first couple times you paid him up front for the
- 22 eight-ball?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And then after that, was there a period of time where he
- 25 was fronting you, giving you the drugs up front, and then you

- 1 paid him afterwards for the drugs?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And on how many occasions were you fronted the drugs?
- 4 A. I don't remember.
- 5 Q. How often were you fronted drugs?
- 6 A. Every couple days.
- 7 Q. When you look back now, it's now January of 2006, when
- 8 you look back at the time period you were buying from Eugene
- 9 Gavin, can you recall for the judge, just going back to his

- 10 house frequently on a regular basis?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Were you at his house on more than 10 occasions?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And there was never a reason for you to go to the house
- 15 other than to buy an eight-ball of crack cocaine?
- 16 A. Right.
- 17 Q. And, Ms. Welsh, you realize that from your testimony and
- 18 from your statement to law enforcement, that your own
- 19 Sentencing Guidelines that you are facing in this case have
- 20 been calculated because of how much crack cocaine you said you
- 21 purchased from Eugene Gavin, do you realize that?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. So why is it that you're here today telling the judge
- 24 that you bought more crack cocaine from Eugene Gavin --
- MR. BRABENDER: Your Honor, I would object to that.

- 1 THE COURT: Overruled.
- 2 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 3 Q. Why are you telling the judge that you bought more crack

- 4 cocaine from Eugene Gavin than Mr. Gavin is even saying you
- 5 bought?
- 6 A. I'm telling the truth.
- 7 Q. When they approached you in August of 2004, did you feel
- 8 pretty confident that you were busted and the EAGLE Task Force
- 9 guys, they had the goods on you and you were in trouble?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Is that why you confessed to them at that time?
- 12 A. Yes.
- MR. PICCININI: That's all I have.
- 14 THE COURT: All right, Mr. Brabender.
- MR. BRABENDER: Thank you, your Honor.
- 16 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 17 BY MR. BRABENDER:
- 18 Q. Ms. Welsh, you were indicted for this conspiracy in
- 19 January of 2005?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And on August 19th do you recall your testimony of 2005,
- 22 that's when you pled guilty as charged, is that correct?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And in your testimony you said that you were interviewed
- 25 by the authorities regarding this on August 27th of 2004, did

- 1 you actually mean 2005 -- I think you responded yes to the
- 2 question was it August 27th of '04, was it actually after you
- 3 pled guilty that you sat down with the authorities?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. It was before?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. So it was August 27th of '04?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. In other words, before you were indicted in this matter?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Okay. Now, your testimony is that it was sometime after
- 12 April of '04 that you had contact with Mr. Gavin regarding the
- 13 sales of cocaine, true?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Do you know exactly when it was in April of '04 that your
- 16 boyfriend, Mr. Gambill, went to prison?
- 17 A. April 2nd.
- 18 Q. April 2nd?
- 19 A. Yes.

- 20 Q. And, furthermore, your testimony is that you would meet
- 21 with Mr. Gavin at his house on West 20th Street, smoke weed and

Page 25 of 65

- 22 eventually purchase crack cocaine, true?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Did you ever purchase more or less than an eight-ball of
- 25 crack from Mr. Gavin?

- 1 A. I don't remember.
- 2 Q. Can you tell me how many rocks are in an eight-ball that
- 3 you would purchase?
- 4 A. I don't remember.
- 5 Q. When you say that you would make between \$260 to \$280
- 6 when you sold an eight-ball, was that profit or the total
- 7 amount that you would receive?
- 8 A. Would you say that again.
- 9 Q. Okay. You said that you would purchase an eight-ball
- 10 from Mr. Gavin for \$130, true?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Was that always the price or could it have been more or
- 13 less than that?

- 14 A. No, that was always the price.
- 15 Q. Okay. And then your testimony was that you'd get between
- 16 \$260 and \$280 for the sales that you made; was that the total
- 17 amount that you would receive or did you consider that profit
- 18 over the \$130?
- 19 A. No, that was the total amount.
- 20 Q. You said this activity began in April of '04 and
- 21 continued until the beginning of June, true?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. So your testimony is that, basically, the entire month of
- 24 April and the entire month of May you purchased cocaine from
- 25 Mr. Gavin, correct?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. And if I recall your testimony, you said that would be
- 3 usually about three times a week?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. So that gets us into the range where you were there maybe
- 6 25 to 30 times?
- 7 A. I was there quite a few times.

- 8 Q. As you did testify near the end of your testimony, you
- 9 said you were telling the truth, right?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Do you recall being interviewed back in August of '04 by
- 12 FBI agents concerning this matter?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Were you telling the truth back then?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Is it true that you told the authorities then that you
- 17 purchased an eighth of an ounce of crack cocaine from Mr. Gavin
- 18 every few days for just a couple of weeks?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Okay. And you were telling the truth back then?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. When you say the words "a couple of weeks," do you mean
- 23 two weeks, is two a couple to you?
- 24 A. No, it went between April to June, beginning of June.
- 25 Q. So are you saying -- could you state yes or no then as to

1 whether or not you were telling the truth if you said this

- 2 activity was for a couple of weeks?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. You were telling the truth?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And a couple of weeks to you is two weeks or not?
- 7 A. I don't know.
- 8 Q. What does the word couple mean to you?
- 9 A. A couple -- they happened between April and June.
- 10 Q. Do you know what a 5K1.1 motion is?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Was that ever explained to you by authorities or your
- 13 attorney or the court?
- 14 A. I'm pretty sure.
- 15 Q. You know it's an avenue whereby you could basically get a
- 16 sentencing bargain after you pled guilty if you cooperated and
- 17 gave substantial assistance to authorities?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And that was your purpose here, after you did plead
- 20 guilty, to give that substantial assistance and get a
- 21 sentencing break, true?
- 22 A. Yes.

Case 1:05-cr-00004-SJM Document 70 Filed 02/28/2006 Page 29 of 65 23 Q. Have you been sentenced yet?

24 A. No.

25 Q. When are you supposed to be sentenced?

- 1 A. February 1st.
- 2 Q. Was it at the conclusion of Mr. Gavin's case, to see what
- 3 happens to him?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. Has there been continuances for your sentencing at all?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Has there been any particular reason why it's been
- 8 continued?
- 9 A. I was pregnant, it was November 16th and I was pregnant,
- 10 I just had my baby November 23rd.
- 11 Q. Now, to receive the sentencing benefits that you expect
- 12 to get, you know you had to give information and at least come
- 13 here today and testify against Mr. Gavin, right?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And if you did not do that, you would not get those
- 16 sentencing benefits that you think you might receive, true?

- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Now, do you have any notes regarding your activities,
- 19 your purchases from Mr. Gavin, would you have had -- anything
- 20 other than your word, anything that you would have written
- 21 these are the days I went to see him?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. You obviously had some regular customers and you had
- 24 received those names from your boyfriend, Mr. Gambill, right?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. How did you know who these customers were?
- 2 A. By my mother.
- 3 Q. I'm sorry.
- 4 A. My mother is an addict, they were friends.
- 5 Q. So how was it -- did you get this information from your
- 6 mother then?
- 7 A. What information?
- 8 THE COURT: Start that again, I don't think she
- 9 understands the question.
- 10 BY MR. BRABENDER:

- 11 Q. Okay, I'll back up a little bit. You got names from Mr.
- 12 Gambill, your boyfriend, after he was sent to prison, true?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Now, you mentioned that they were addicted friends of
- 15 your mother, is that what you said?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Did you get these names of people to sell crack to from
- 18 your mother or from Mr. Gambill?
- 19 A. Both.
- 20 Q. Both, okay. Now, do you have these names and addresses
- 21 written down anywhere?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. I'm not going to ask you for any names, but did you have
- 24 any notes whatsoever?
- 25 A. No.

- 1 Q. Can you tell how many names Mr. Gambill gave you?
- 2 A. It was quite a few.
- 3 Q. How would you remember who they were or where they were,
- 4 what their phone numbers were?

- 5 A. We had a cell phone.
- 6 Q. Did you log those names and numbers into your cell phone?

Document 70

- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Are you saying every cell phone number that you would
- 9 have to call people on was in that cell phone?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Did the authorities take your cell phone?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Did they do anything to verify those numbers being on
- 14 your telephone, cell phone?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Where is that particular cell phone today?
- 17 A. I lost it.
- 18 Q. You lost it. When did you lose it?
- 19 A. I don't remember.
- 20 Q. Do you have any notes on the amount of profit that you
- 21 had whatsoever?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. Did you have anything to verify what you told the FBI
- 24 agents on August 27, 2004 or what you're telling us today,
- 25 other than your own word?

- 1 A. Right.
- 2 Q. You don't have anything further, right?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. I don't want to tread too much on the same subject here
- 5 but, once again, the frequency you said you would be at Mr.
- 6 Gavin's house every other day; in other words, you would sell
- 7 this crack overnight and be back the next day?
- 8 A. Right, the first couple times. And then it was every
- 9 couple days.
- 10 Q. Now, your testimony is that was for a couple of weeks or
- 11 a couple of months?
- 12 A. Couple of months.
- 13 Q. Now, that's not what you told the FBI agents on August
- 14 27th of '04, right?
- 15 A. Right.
- MR. BRABENDER: Okay. I have nothing further.
- 17 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 18 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 19 Q. Ma'am, with regard to why your sentencing was continued
- 20 until after Mr. Gavin's sentencing, did your attorney on

- 21 November 10, 2005, file a motion to continue the sentencing
- 22 hearing?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And at that time, as noted in paragraph three of this
- 25 particular motion, it indicates here that you were pregnant,

- 1 that due your due date was on November 26, 2005, is that
- 2 correct?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And was your pregnancy, as indicated in this motion
- 5 classified as high risk due to the recency of the last
- 6 pregnancy?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Was there some concern that you not undergo the stress of
- 9 a possible prison sentence 10 days before your due date, which
- 10 is when your original sentence was scheduled?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. In addition, did your attorney request a 60 day
- 13 continuance because you needed to make arrangements after the
- 14 baby was born for custody of the child should a sentence of

- 15 prison be imposed?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. So this moving of the sentencing, did it have anything to
- 18 do with Mr. Gavin's sentencing here today?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. Now, Ms. Welsh, I need to clarify some points because of
- 21 information that I have in my possession that has been provided
- 22 to the defense, with regard to some conversations you continued
- 23 to have with Anthony Gambill while he was in prison. Maybe at
- 24 the time neither one of you realized it, but all those prison
- 25 conversations were recorded, you now know that, is that

- 1 correct?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. You have been provided, through defense counsel, as well
- 4 as Mr. Gavin, not only the recordings themselves but
- 5 transcripts of those particular calls?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. I'm going to approach you and show you what appears to be
- 8 a telephone conversation dated May 30, 2004, between yourself

- 9 and Mr. Gambill. My concern is that you be able to answer
- 10 because it reflects somewhat I think on the judge's
- 11 determination as to whether or not all the way into June of
- 12 2004 you were continuing to purchase crack cocaine.
- MR. PICCININI: Your Honor, I'm going to mark this
- 14 as Government Exhibit 1 just for identification purposes.
- 15 THE COURT: All right.
- 16 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 17 Q. Ma'am, at the top of this it purports to be May 30, 2004
- 18 at 15:22 or 3:22 in the afternoon, to 3:37 in the afternoon, a
- 19 conversation between you and Anthony Gambill, while Anthony
- 20 Gambill was incarcerated in the Erie County Prison, do you see
- 21 that?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And at the beginning of the conversation there's a couple
- 24 instances here where actually you and Mr. Gambill talk about
- 25 Eugene Gavin, I want to go through that with you. At the

- 1 beginning it's you speaking and you say, "I talked to Antonio
- 2 yesterday." And Mr. Gambill says "what did he say." At this

Page 37 of 65

- 3 time you're not cooperating, this is just a phone conversation
- 4 that either of you either don't realize is recorded or you just
- 5 didn't care, one way or the other, is that correct?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. This isn't you wearing a wire or in any fashion
- 8 cooperating against Mr. Gambill or Mr. Gavin at that particular
- 9 time, this is just a conversation you're having over the phone
- 10 that happens to be recorded by the prison officials, right?
- 11 A. Right.
- 12 Q. And when you say "I talked to Antonio yesterday," are you
- 13 referring to an Antonio Bolden?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Mr. Gambill says "what did he say." And you respond,
- 16 "I was like what you all just forgot about your homeboy."
- 17 And Mr. Gambill says "and what did he say." "He was like, no I
- 18 got a job now I don't hustle. I was like damn. What happened
- 19 to Gene and he was like um, Gene fell off."
- 20 So on May 30, 2004, first of all, this Antonio is
- 21 indicating that he got a job and he's not hustling. But he
- 22 specifically told you about Gene, that he liked fell off. What
- 23 did he mean on May 30, 2004, asking about what the deal was

- 24 with Gene, he fell off?
- 25 A. That he wasn't selling drugs no more.

- 1 THE COURT: Say that again into the microphone?
- THE WITNESS: He wasn't selling drugs no more.
- 3 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 4 Q. And then on the next page, page two of the transcript,
- 5 here you say, talk about how much money Gene owes you. And Mr.
- 6 Gambill responds "Gene owes me like two hundred dollars."
- 7 When you started in the drug dealing relationship with Mr.
- 8 Gavin, did you know in the beginning that Mr. Gavin owed
- 9 Anthony Gambill some money for some previous drug debts?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. You didn't know that?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Did you find out over time that Mr. Gavin owed Anthony
- 14 Gambill some money?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And might that be why he was able to convince Mr. Gavin
- 17 to deal with you during this timeframe?

- 18 A. Yes.
- MR. BRABENDER: Your Honor, I would object.
- THE COURT: Sustained.
- 21 BY MR. PICCININI:
- 22 Q. My question for you, Ms. Welsh, is that you testified
- 23 that from April to June, to the beginning of June, in fairness
- 24 to you, you did say the beginning of June, that you were
- 25 purchasing crack cocaine from Mr. Gavin. But this transcript

- 1 seems to reflect that you've testified that as of May 30, 2004,
- 2 Gene fell off?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Can you explain to Judge McLaughlin how was it that you
- 5 could have been purchasing crack cocaine from Mr. Gavin if Mr.
- 6 Gavin stopped selling crack cocaine, according to this
- 7 transcript, on May 30, 2004?
- 8 A. I don't remember.
- 9 Q. Okay. How far into May were you still purchasing crack
- 10 cocaine from Mr. Gavin; you said the beginning of June, here is
- 11 May 30th, the end of May that he's done, did it even go into

- 12 May of 2004?
- 13 A. I don't remember.
- 14 Q. Do you recall going to the place with the purple door
- 15 where Mr. Gavin and his wife would smoke pot with you, do you
- 16 recall going to his residence at least let's say 10 times?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And was there ever a time that you didn't purchase an
- 19 eight-ball of crack when you went there?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 MR. PICCININI: That's all I have.
- THE COURT: Mr. Brabender, do you have anything
- 23 else?
- MR. BRABENDER: Nothing further from this witness,
- 25 your Honor.

- 1 THE COURT: Why did you tell the FBI a couple of
- 2 weeks -- let me put it this way. Is your recollection, as you
- 3 testified today, as to the number of weeks that you went over
- 4 to purchase crack cocaine, different today than it was when you
- 5 talked to the FBI?

Document 70

- 7 everything now.
- 8 THE COURT: What is your best recollection as you
- testify today, as to the number of times you purchased crack
- cocaine from Mr. Gavin?
- 11 THE WITNESS: I don't know.
- 12 THE COURT: You don't know?
- 13 THE WITNESS: (Witness shakes head.)
- THE COURT: You can get off the stand. Do you have 14
- 15 something else, Mr. Piccinini?
- 16 MR. PICCININI: Yes, your Honor.
- 17 THE COURT: Hang on one second, get back on the
- stand. 18
- 19 FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- BY MR. PICCININI:
- 21 Ma'am, the judge referred to your August 27, 2004
- 22 interview with the FBI. On August 27, 2004, was that the day
- that the police first approached you and confronted you about
- 24 your drug dealing activities with Eugene Gavin?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. And on that particular date were you asked questions
- 2 about how often you purchased from Eugene Gavin?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. On August 27, 2004, had you asked for Mr. Patton to be
- 5 appointed to your case yet, did you even have a lawyer?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. At that point in time, did anyone talk with you about --
- 8 did any attorney talk with you about a sentencing reduction,
- 9 filing a motion on your behalf?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Did anyone talk with you at that time about the
- 12 sentencing guidelines and the benefit you would receive from a
- 13 lower quantity of crack cocaine, anybody talk with you about
- 14 that?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Now, the agents did tell you that it would be in your
- 17 best interests to come clean on what you were doing, is that
- 18 correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. All right, I'm going to show you what I will refer to as
- 21 Government Exhibit No. 2 for identification -- ma'am, this

- 22 purports to be the FD-302 of the interview that you gave on
- 23 August 27, 2004, to Special Agent Jason Crouse and Detective
- 24 Sergeant Jeff Greene, is that correct?
- 25 A. Yes.

Page 43 of 65

- 1 Q. Now, on the second page of this document I'm going to ask
- 2 you was your recollection of the events that occurred in April
- 3 of 2004 through May of 2004 better back in August, within a
- 4 couple of months of this happening, than it is here today, in
- 5 fairness, two years later?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Would it refresh your recollection as to your involvement
- 8 with Mr. Gavin if you were to review that 302 from August of
- 9 2004?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. I'm going to ask you to read those highlighted paragraphs
- 12 on there, these two that have been highlighted. Ma'am, Judge
- 13 McLaughlin has asked you why did you tell them two weeks, now
- 14 you're saying what could be as long as two months. That's not
- 15 a hard question. And I put you on the witness stand, I want to

- 16 make sure you're telling the truth. How frequently do you
- 17 recall going back to this man's house, he says it was twice and
- 18 on the third time he wasn't about to front you the cocaine.
- 19 Was it two times, was it 10 times -- you couldn't tell the
- 20 judge exactly how many times, I don't know if we would be able
- 21 to expect you to recount each one -- but is Mr. Gavin right or
- 22 are you correct?
- 23 A. I'm telling the truth, I just don't remember right now.
- 24 Q. How often did you go to his house, you were able to give
- 25 the judge a description of the house, what you did in the

- 1 place, did you just go there a couple times?
- 2 A. No, I went there more than a couple times. It could have
- 3 been like -- three weeks or five weeks, I'm not sure, I don't
- 4 remember. But I went to his house quite a few times. I'm not
- 5 sure when it stopped.
- 6 Q. Was it at least two weeks?
- 7 A. Again, it could have been.
- 8 Q. Could it have been less than two weeks, just a couple of
- 9 days?

Case 1:05-cr-00004-SJM

- 10 A. No.
- MR. PICCININI: That's all I have, judge.
- 12 THE COURT: Mr. Brabender, do you have anything

Document 70

- 13 else?
- MR. BRABENDER: I have no further questions.
- 15 THE COURT: What is the least amount of time you
- 16 visited in weeks, if indeed it is weeks, what is the least
- 17 amount of weeks that you visited this man's house for the
- 18 purpose of purchasing crack?
- 19 THE WITNESS: Between two to three weeks.
- THE COURT: All right, you can get down. Anything
- 21 else from the government?
- MR. PICCININI: No, your Honor.
- THE COURT: Did you move those exhibits, Mr.
- 24 Piccinini?
- MR. PICCININI: I did not. I'll mark them as

- 1 Government Exhibit No. 1 and Government Exhibit 2 and move them
- 2 into evidence.
- 3 THE COURT: Those are admitted. Anything further

- 4 from the government on any point?
- 5 MR. PICCININI: No, your Honor.
- 6 THE COURT: Anything from you, Mr. Brabender?
- 7 MR. BRABENDER: Yes, your Honor, Mr. Gavin would
- 8 testify.
- 9 THE COURT: We're going to take a short recess
- 10 before we pick up on this.
- 11 (Recess from 10:40 a.m.; until 10:44 a.m.)
- 12 THE COURT: All right, Mr. Brabender.
- MR. BRABENDER: Your Honor, after discussion with
- 14 Mr. Gavin, we're not going to present any evidence.
- 15 THE COURT: All right. It appears that none of your
- 16 other exceptions here affect the guideline range, is that
- 17 right?
- MR. BRABENDER: That's correct, your Honor.
- 19 THE COURT: What do you want to tell me by way of
- 20 brief summary about this, Mr. Piccinini -- obviously, you got
- 21 to prove it by a preponderance and consistent with the
- 22 principles articulated in -- I believe it was United States v.
- 23 Gibbs?
- MR. PICCININI: Yes, your Honor. Just more of a

25 practical point. The guideline applies at level 28 to the

37

Page 47 of 65

- 1 defendant, applies to quantities in excess of 20 grams. So the
- 2 court is in a position of making estimations, here it doesn't
- 3 have to be the exact, I think 31.83 grams, but it has to be
- 4 grams or more to stay at that quantity. And the law, as you
- 5 indicated, there needs to be sufficient evidence, reliability
- 6 to support its probable accuracy. From another practical
- 7 standpoint, it has been my experience and maybe this is the
- 8 exception, that people come into court and increase the amount
- 9 of drugs that are attributable, because Ms. Welsh's guideline
- 10 ends up being the same as Mr. Gavin's based upon what she says.
- 11 At all times had the opportunity to downplay her role, that is
- 12 what we typically see. And her recollection today isn't great
- 13 two years later of the exact number of times. But, judge, it
- 14 was more than enough times to exceed 20 grams of crack cocaine,
- 15 to find three-and-a-half grams, an eight-ball at a time, she
- 16 was there just on a regular basis. Let's say it's more than 10
- 17 times, which is fewer than the calculation by probation, which
- 18 far exceeds the 20 gram threshold.

- 19 THE COURT: What would it have to be, just
- 20 arithmetically, how many purchases are there for 20 grams?
- MR. PICCININI: As few as seven would get you beyond
- 22 21 grams. Even possibly six times would get you, six times
- 23 three and a half would just be over 20 grams. That's all I
- 24 have, your Honor.
- 25 THE COURT: All right. Mr. Brabender.

- 1 MR. BRABENDER: Your Honor, just briefly, I truly
- 2 believe that the testimony was far too vague and without the
- 3 prodding she received from the questioning and without her own
- 4 puffing, I don't really think we're leaving this hearing today
- 5 knowing what the quantities were, how many occasions there
- 6 were. If you believe the FBI reports, she was purchasing crack
- 7 from other individuals as well. I'm not sure about the
- 8 timeframes here, being it was several months later that she was
- 9 originally questioned by the FBI concerning this, now another
- 10 year and a half after that she's testifying today, I think we
- 11 leave this hearing not knowing what the amount was. She
- 12 understands the 5K1.1 deal, that she has to be here to testify,

- Case 1:05-cr-00004-SJM Document 70 Filed 02/28/20 she knows she has to give evidence against Eugene Gavin. I
- 14 think it was stated that she was in probably at the time
- 15 smoking marijuana and maybe doing drugs. Here we have this
- 16 individual that sells crack rocks to her mother's best friends,
- 17 I mean, how much of her testimony are we suppose to believe
- 18 really, your Honor. I would just think in the interest of due
- 19 process this has not been proven by a preponderance.
- THE COURT: You understand full well you don't have
- 21 the burden, it's the government's burden.
- MR. BRABENDER: Right.
- 23 THE COURT: But you suggest in your papers that
- 24 there were two sales?
- MR. BRABENDER: Well, that's what we allege. I know

- 1 we didn't testify.
- 2 THE COURT: I have no evidence on this record on
- 3 that point, but that's the contention in the papers, though, is
- 4 that correct?
- 5 MR. BRABENDER: Yes, your Honor. That's what I
- 6 believe Mr. Gavin told Mr. Lowers at the time of the

- 7 presentence, I think. I'd have to double check my records.
- 8 THE COURT: All right.
- 9 MR. BRABENDER: That's what we do allege, your
- 10 Honor. Thank you.
- 11 THE COURT: Let me get an order here on the record.
- 12 ORDER
- Presently pending before the court are exceptions to
- 14 the presentence report filed on behalf of the defendant.
- 15 Specifically, the defendant objects to the finding by the
- 16 probation officer wherein he attributed 31.89 grams of crack
- 17 cocaine. The defendant contends in its papers that as a matter
- 18 of fact there was significantly less crack cocaine involved.
- 19 According to the defendant, approximately "seven grams only."
- 20 The upshot of which, according to the defendant, would be to
- 21 reduce the total offense level from 25 to 23.
- In resolving this issue, I am guided by the
- 23 principles set forth in United_States_v._Gibbs, 190 F.3d 188
- ------ -----
- 24 (3rd Cir. 1999). Specifically, evidence supporting a finding
- 25 of drug quantity must have "sufficient evidence of reliability

- 1 to support its probable accuracy." That would be at page 203.
- 2 And, additionally, "it is appropriate to estimate drug quantity
- 3 based on evidence of the average drug transaction during the
- 4 course of the conspiracy." That would be at page 219.
- 5 In this case the government presented the testimony
- 6 of Michelle Welsh. Based upon her testimony and, of course, my
- 7 opportunity to observe her demeanor and draw conclusions with
- 8 respect to her credibility, I find that subsequent to her
- 9 boyfriend, Anthony Gambill's incarceration, arrangements were
- 10 made whereby she would become involved in drug transactions
- 11 with Mr. Gavin. I find credible her testimony with respect to
- 12 her visitations to Mr. Gavin's home. I find that she described
- 13 it with such particularity that it lends additional credence to
- 14 her contention that she was there. Ms. Welsh testified that as
- 15 a general proposition when she was present at the home, she
- 16 purchased what she referred to as eight-balls. Otherwise,
- 17 which would be the same as one-eighth ounce of crack cocaine.
- I also find her testimony credible to the extent
- 19 that she testified that the eight-balls were broken up by Mr.
- 20 Gavin into smaller rocks for sale on the street in the amount
- 21 of \$20 per rock.

- 23 Mr. Gavin's home for the purpose of purchasing crack cocaine
- 24 two or three times a week.
- 25 With respect to the duration of the purchases, the

- 1 witness indicated here that she thought it was for a period of
- 2 time from April through May. She sometime ago, when initially
- 3 interviewed by the FBI, the record reflects that she had
- 4 indicated that she had purchased crack cocaine from Mr. Gavin
- 5 over a period of a couple of weeks. On this point I do not
- 6 find that the witness, to the extent that the witness's
- 7 testimony today was a longer period of time, I do not find her
- 8 testimony to have been intentionally deceptive. I find, based
- 9 upon all the testimony, that the government has demonstrated by
- 10 a preponderance of the evidence that there were sufficient, and
- 11 I so find, that there were sufficient visits to Mr. Gavin's
- 12 residence and sufficient purchases of crack cocaine to
- 13 substantiate the finding by the probation officer of 31.89
- 14 grams of cocaine.
- I also note for the record that an additional

- 16 indicia of reliability lies in the fact that by testifying in
- 17 the manner in which she has, the witness has in fact increased
- 18 her own drug quantity for sentencing purposes, rather than
- 19 reduced it. The exception is overruled.
- I make the following findings. The total offense
- 21 level is 25; with a criminal history category of V. Statutory
- 22 provision as to custody not less than five years to 40 years
- 23 imprisonment. Guidelines 100 to 125. Statutory provision as
- 24 to probation ineligible. Also ineligible under the guidelines.
- 25 Supervised release, with respect the statutory provision, at

- 1 least four years. Guidelines four to five. Statutory
- 2 provision as to a fine \$2 million. Guideline provisions
- 3 \$10,000 to \$2 million. Restitution is inapplicable under both
- 4 the statutory and guideline provisions. A special assessment
- 5 of \$100 applies with respect to the statutory and guideline
- 6 provisions.
- 7 Let me just go back and clear up one quick point
- 8 insofar as the exceptions were concerned. While I did note for
- 9 the record that I find that the government had demonstrated by

Page 54 of 65

- 11 attributed by the probation officer was in all likelihood
- 12 accurate, I should also note for the record that in order to be
- 13 in the guideline range which the probation officer found would
- 14 be appropriate, as little as 20 grams of crack cocaine could
- 15 have been sold. And I certainly find that the government had
- 16 demonstrated that amount by a preponderance of the evidence.
- Now, back to my findings here. If I'm repeating
- 18 myself, so be it. Restitution is inapplicable under both the
- 19 statutory and guideline provisions. And a special assessment
- 20 of \$100 applies with respect to both.
- All right, Mr. Brabender, prior to imposing sentence
- 22 is there anything you want to say or is there anything your
- 23 client would like to say on his own behalf?
- MR. BRABENDER: Your Honor, I did in the exceptions
- 25 add additional matters for consideration, I will not repeat

- 1 what's in there, just make the arguments on behalf of Mr.
- 2 Gavin. Mr. Gavin doesn't have anything that he would like to
- 3 address the court on at this time. I have nothing further,

- 4 your Honor.
- 5 THE COURT: Mr. Gavin, just so that I'm clear, you
- 6 understand you do have the right, you have the right of
- 7 allocution at sentencing. But my understanding is you do not
- 8 want to say anything, is that correct -- you do have the right
- 9 to do it if you want to -- come on up to the podium, sir.
- THE DEFENDANT: I just want to apologize to the
- 11 court for my involvement in this crime. It is a waste of the
- 12 government's time and money.
- 13 THE COURT: I can't hear you, Mr. Gavin, take your
- 14 time and speak up?
- 15 THE DEFENDANT: I just wanted to apologize to the
- 16 court for my involvement in this crime. And wasting the time
- 17 and money for this situation.
- 18 THE COURT: All right, thank you, Mr. Gavin.
- MR. BRABENDER: Also, I didn't mention it, I do want
- 20 to stress the fact that he does have two young children and a
- 21 spouse as well.
- THE COURT: What are their ages?
- MR. BRABENDER: Seven and five.
- 24 THE COURT: All right. Thank you, sir. Mr.
- 25 Piccinini.

MR. PICCININI: Your Honor, you have the benefit of 1 the presentence report which sufficiently sets forth the details. Two issues for the record that I want to bring up. One, after Ms. Welsh testified, I did provide the Jencks material, the portion of Ms. Welch's previous statement to the FBI. There is no cover letter, I just want to make it clear for the record that that statement was actually provided to defense counsel consistent with the Jencks Act. 9 THE COURT: Are you talking about the 302? 10 MR. PICCININI: The FD-302, which was actually admitted as an exhibit, the pertinent portion of that 11 12 concerning Mr. Gavin was provided to defense counsel. THE COURT: Just as a housekeeping matter, the 13 portion you were asking her to read, the 302, do we have a cover sheet on that or is that somehow identified? 16 MR. PICCININI: This entire 302 and the portion that she read through is actually highlighted. 17 18 THE COURT: It's identified, all right.

MR. PICCININI: Your Honor, one other issue.

- 20 Recently a family member of Mr. Gavin's went to Ms. Welsh's
- 21 work and approached her, concerning she was a snitch, an
- 22 informant. Ms. Welsh tried to express she really wasn't an
- 23 informant in this case, she was a charged defendant as well.
- 24 She suffered a bit of harassment. To the point the person
- 25 indicated, who I believe is the defendant's wife, that she

- 1 wanted to come over the counter at Ms. Welsh. I'm just putting
- 2 this on the record today because I am concerned that if any
- 3 attempts to intimidate a government witness would continue, I
- 4 don't know the extent to which any of this is attributable to
- 5 Mr. Gavin --
- 6 THE COURT: Have there been charges filed as a
- 7 result of this?
- 8 MR. PICCININI: There have not been, it does not
- 9 rise sufficiently to the level. Ms. Welsh actually didn't want
- 10 us to go any further with it. But she is still concerned that
- 11 in light of her being requested to testify today that someone
- 12 from the family is going to attempt to approach her and the
- 13 government would not take that lightly. That's all that I

- 14 have.
- 15 THE COURT: Is that Mr. Gavin's wife in the back?
- MR. PICCININI: I don't believe she's here in the
- 17 courtroom today, your Honor.
- 18 THE COURT: Well, aside from calling it to my
- 19 attention, there's really nothing that can be done at this
- 20 point absent --
- 21 MR. PICCININI: I'm calling it to your attention and
- 22 making sure that Mr. Gavin and his family --
- 23 THE COURT: All right, I think Mr. Gavin has just
- 24 heard what you said.
- MR. PICCININI: Thank you, your Honor.

- 1 THE COURT: You did understand that, Mr. Gavin,
- 2 didn't you?
- THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
- 4 THE COURT: In the wake of Booker, the Sentencing
- 5 Guidelines are of course advisory. However, I'm obligated to
- 6 consult those guidelines in determining an appropriate

7 sentence. In addition to the guidelines under Booker, I must

8 also consider various other factors set forth at Section

- 9 3553(a), which requires courts to impose a sentence which is
- 10 "sufficient, but not greater than necessary" to comply with the
- 11 purposes set forth in paragraph two. Section 3553(a)(2)
- 12 provides in relevant part that these purposes are:
- 13 (A) to reflect the seriousness of the offense, to
- 14 promote respect for the law, and to provide just punishment for
- 15 the offense;
- 16 (B) to afford deterrence to criminal conduct;
- 17 (C) to protect the public from further crimes of
- 18 the defendant; and
- 19 (D) to provide the defendant with needed
- 20 educational or vocational training, medical care, or other
- 21 correctional treatment in the most effective manner.
- That section further directs that the sentencing
- 23 court consider, (1) the nature and circumstances of the offense
- 24 and the history and characteristics of the defendant; the kinds
- 25 of sentences available; the need to avoid unwanted sentencing

- 1 disparities among defendants with similar records who have been
- 2 found guilty of similar misconduct; and the need to provide
- 3 restitution to any victims of the offense.
- 4 So in fashioning the sentence here, I have carefully
- 5 considered the advisory guideline range, as well as the other
- 6 factors which I have just articulated.
- 7 In my view dealing crack cocaine is a very serious
- 8 offense. It is an extremely addictive and destructive drug.
- 9 I note from reviewing the presentence report, insofar as it
- 10 reflects on the history and the characteristics of this
- 11 defendant, that this defendant has a significant criminal
- 12 history dating back to age 14. There have been multiple
- 13 criminal convictions. He has frequently violated the terms and
- 14 conditions of his parole. He has shown a complete disregard
- 15 for authority figures in general and the law in particular.
- 16 I also think that deterrence in a case like this is, insofar as
- 17 fashioning an appropriate sentence, is important. And very
- 18 importantly, based upon this defendant's background, extensive
- 19 criminal background, I consider the protection of the public to
- 20 be an extremely important factor as well.
- All right, Mr. Gavin, stand up for sentencing.

Case 1:05-cr-00004-SJM Document 70 Filed 02/28/2006 Pursuant to the Sentencing Reform Act of 1984, it is

- 23 the judgment of the court that the defendant, Eugene Lamont
- 24 Gavin, is hereby committed to the custody of the Bureau of
- 25 Prisons to be imprisoned for a term of 125 months. The term of

- 1 imprisonment imposed by this judgment shall run concurrent to
- 2 the defendant's term of imprisonment imposed at Docket Nos.
- 3 1371 of 2004 and 129 of 2005, Erie County Court of Common
- 4 Pleas.
- 5 Upon release from imprisonment, the defendant shall
- 6 be placed on supervised release for a term of four years.
- Within 72 hours of release from the custody of the
- 8 Bureau of Prisons, the defendant shall report in person to the
- 9 probation office in the district to which this defendant is
- 10 released.
- While on supervised release, the defendant shall not
- 12 commit another federal, state or local crime; shall comply with
- 13 the standard conditions of supervision recommended by the
- 14 Sentencing Commission and adopted by this court; and shall
- 15 comply with the following additional conditions.

- The defendant shall not illegally possess a
- 17 controlled substance.
- The defendant shall not possess a firearm or
- 19 destructive device.
- The defendant shall participate in a program of
- 21 testing and, if necessary, treatment for substance abuse as
- 22 directed by the probation officer, until such time as the
- 23 defendant is released from the program by the probation
- 24 officer.
- Further, the defendant shall be required to

- 1 contribute to the costs of services for any such treatment in
- 2 an amount determined by the probation officer but not to exceed
- 3 the actual cost.
- 4 The defendant shall submit to one drug urinalysis
- 5 within 15 days after being placed on supervision and at least
- 6 two periodic tests thereafter.
- 7 It is further ordered that the defendant shall pay
- 8 to the United States a special assessment of \$100, which shall
- 9 be paid to the United States District Court Clerk forthwith.

10	Case 1:05-cr-00004-SJM Document 70 Filed 02/28/2006 Page 63 of I find the defendant does not have the ability to	35
11	pay a fine, consequently, I will waive a fine in this case.	
12	Mr. Gavin, do you understand that you do have the	
13	right to appeal this sentence which I imposed here this	
14	morning, but if you choose to do so, you must do so within 10	
15	days, do you understand that?	
16	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.	
17	THE COURT: Anything further from the defendant?	
18	MR. BRABENDER: No, your Honor.	
19	THE COURT: All right, we're adjourned.	
20		
21	(Whereupon, at 11:05 a.m., the Sentencing	
22	proceedings were concluded.)	
23		
24		
25		
	50	
1	CERTIFICATE	
2		
3		
J		

file:///A|/GAVINSTG.TXT

I, Ronald J. Bench, certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter. 12 Ronald J. Bench